I think we have as much to learn from vision and imagination as from volumes and falling transaction costs. You know, manufacturing is a very simple matter: if you make a thousand of these bottles a minute, prices will fall. If you are 55 times slower, they will be totally unaffordable. We are uncompetitive because we do not have that scale. We are uncompetitive because we are not an integrated area with a single market. Free trade areas can protect themselves from other parts of the world. We can also imagine protectionism extending to the free trade area borders. Economists level that criticism against the European Union, a large single market that is relatively closed to others and therefore poses a problem. Your large single market increases well-being within Europe but reduces global well-being because it is a relatively closed area, especially for agricultural products. President Terrab was right to say that everything comes down to agriculture because it employs 50% of the working population, so if you do not take care of that 23% of GDP and 50% of the working population, there will be no financial or industrial revolution. We must start with our real economy.

The European Union reduces global well-being in the sense that it is an agricultural fortress, so there is always that ambiguity. But if we increase well-being, growth and scale and if we reduce costs, we will improve Africa’s appeal, an urgent matter today, and others will take care of global well-being.

Regarding custom duties, yes Nathalie it is true, they will be an obstacle. Our taxation system must be adapted. In Benin and the Union of Sub-Saharan Africa, taxes account for 15% of GDP—two times lower than in the OECD and China. What’s more, we withhold almost no tax for social protection. If we did, the gap would be even wider. It is impossible to educate, provide medical care for and transport a population when taxes account for just 15% of GDP. We do a little more because there is a bit of aid and a small deficit, but it is impossible when social security contributions and taxes are just 15%. No government can solve an equation like that. So tax reform is very important. The underlying problem, which is very important in my country, is that 7.5% of the 15% is just customs duties. Export taxes are the biggest item, not import taxes. In other words, most of our countries penalise with taxes, simply because the port of exit is the only place where we can control flows. We tax our exports.

We deserve a lot of credit because despite everything, Africa has increased its exports by roughly 15% each year for the past two decades. Africa benefits from extraordinary international trade dynamics, but we deserve a lot of credit for levying taxes on our cacao, coffee and cotton exports because that is the only way to collect them. We were left with an absolutely unsustainable continent. Elisabeth mentioned resentment. Young generations—I see it in my children—resent French colonisation no more than they do Roman colonisation. A time comes when all of that is water under the bridge. There is no point in dwelling on it. But we were left with a continent without credit, savings, taxation, infrastructure, schools or hospitals. That all adds up to many missing things. Our growth figures have a lot of catching up to do, which is very important. All of us, even very advanced countries like Morocco and, to a lesser extent, South Africa, have very large informal sectors. Benin’s informal sector—I do not know what you would say spontaneously—is as big as in Togo, Nigeria and Côte d’Ivoire. I do not know if you know what the informal sector share of the job market is. If you do not have the figure, I will give it to you: 90%. In Morocco it is 80%, which surprised me even more than the Beninese figure because we have the impression that its economy is completely adjusted to globalisation.

Our real problem is how to entitle people to social protection and lift them out of precariously. And how to use new technology. I strongly believe that the digital modernisation of the informal sector is extremely useful because it is a remarkably productive and efficient sector. It is not just a downgraded formal sector. When all those small businesses have the possibility of storing their data on the Cloud and accessing them on their phones—we saw a little of that in China and a lot in India, which is closer to Africa—they modernise the informal sector. That is a huge challenge, but the first step is entitling people to social benefits. We cannot tell them, “On January 1st we are going to start hammering you with taxes to force you to move from the informal to the formal sector.” That will never work. We must entitle them, use the appropriate technology, look in detail at how e-commerce is developing thanks to informal transport, thanks to the last mile distribution problems. Look at the crossroad between something that might seem archaic and so modern it seems like science fiction, and look at how we are going to gradually undertake a transformation. The upshot is that we will start controlling tax flows, in other words revenue. When 90% of employees have no legal or fiscal existence, no
protection, they cannot pay taxes. When 80% of companies are undeclared, fail to comply with standards, etc. you cannot collect taxes. The only alternative is customs duties, penalising your own exports. The trouble with free trade is that you are going to penalise much less, but consequently you will no longer have revenue flows.

We need transition periods. In my view, making the informal sector more formal and more productive is the key, the answer to your question.