

DEBATE

Jean de Kervasdoué, Professor Emeritus of Economy and Health Management at the Conservatoire national des arts et métiers (Cnam), Founder of the Pasteur/Cnam School of Public Health

Olivier, I am not sure we heard the same things this evening. What Narendra has said was something different, I think. China was able, in 50 years, to increase the life expectancy of its citizens by using fossil fuels and I do not believe that a country like India and some African countries will be able to have this level of development and this level of energy without fossil fuels. Therefore, what I heard Narendra saying is that countries like India and other countries are going to use fossil fuels at a much higher level than the actual level, and I think your summary was very biased.

Narendra Taneja, Chairman of Independent Energy Policy Institute in New Delhi

If you allow me, Chair, very quickly. You see, when you look at India's track record on renewables, what we have achieved in the last five years, trust me, is more than Germany. We have been walking the talk. All that we committed to in Paris, all that we committed to in Glasgow, we have already walked. We have delivered that.

However, that said, at the same time, the world over, 82% of the energy that the world is consuming is coming from traditional sources. In India, the story is more or less the same – 67% of the electricity that we consume is coming from coal.

At the same time, you have to see that India is not some small banana republic. We have security challenges from the north, from the Indian Ocean, from so many sides. When you look at India's energy, 88% of oil that we consume is imported. We consume 5.2 million barrels of oil every day.

We are importing roughly 56% of our total requirement of natural gas. In solar power, 90% of equipment that we are using for solar is imported mainly from China. We also import a big chunk of uranium. That makes us extremely vulnerable in terms of energy security.

Now, the question is that, on the one hand, we have to see the renewables and, at the same time, we have to see the energy security because we are a very large country and also we are threatened from all sides.

The final point I will make is India is more committed than most countries in the global north to the energy transition. You can check it on the coal numbers, facts. However, that said, energy transition in India will be done with Indian characteristics based on the ground realities in



India, based on the fact we still have 700 million people who are below the energy poverty line.

For us, that comes first and if there is international pressure, trust me, we are strong enough to deal with it.

Olivier Appert, Chairman of France Brevets, Scientific Advisor of the Centre for Energy and Climate of Ifri, Former President of the French Energy Council

Unfortunately, we will not have the time for a debate on more general issues. The issues I wanted to debate were your expectations for the next COP28 meeting and the focus on China. China is the elephant in the room and we need to speak about what will happen in China and, depending on what is happening there, this will have a dramatic impact on the energy world and also on the environment worldwide.

Perhaps also a question I wanted to raise is, in 1973, the first oil shock was created by a conflict between Israel and the Palestinians. Perhaps we are at the eve of an oil shock, taking into account the recent events in Gaza.

Renaud Girard, Senior Reporter and International Columnist at *Le Figaro*

It was not the Palestinians, it was an attack by Egypt and Syria at the same time.

Olivier Appert

Yes, I know. However, perhaps we are at the eve of an oil shock, taking into account the fact that the depletion referred to by Nicolas is taking place and the investment in oil and gas has been reduced by a factor of two since 2014.

For the time being, it is the Palestinians, but what will be the position in the next few weeks of the Arab governments? I am not sure. I hope that what we heard from the Advisor of the President of the UAE is right.

I want to thank the panelists and also thank the audience for this debate. Perhaps the next time, it will be necessary to have more time to have an in-depth debate.

Thank you.